

DRAFT PROJECT DOCUMENT
12th TRANCHE OF THE DEVELOPMENT ACCOUNT

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Project Title:	20230 Smart Sustainable Cities for the 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development and the New Urban Agenda in selected countries in the UNECE Region
Start date:	January 2020
End date:	June 2023
Budget:	US\$ 465,000
UMOJA cost centre(s):	13829
UMOJA functional area(s):	20AC0008
Target Countries:	Belarus, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Montenegro
Executing Entity:	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE)
Co-operating Agencies within the UN system:	United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat)
Project Manager:	Gulnara Roll

Brief description:

The adoption of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development by the United Nations General Assembly in 2015, the adoption of the New Urban Agenda in 2016 and of other key international agreements, established a comprehensive policy framework for promoting smart sustainable urban development at national and local levels based on integrated cooperation and involvement of all stakeholders. The development of the UNECE/ITU Key Performance Indicators on Smart Sustainable Cities, the UN-Habitat City Prosperity Index, the UNECE/UN-Habitat Guidelines on evidence-based policies for housing and urban development establishes a sound methodological basis for the implementation of evidence-based sustainable urban policies at national and local level. UNECE is an intergovernmental body comprising 56 member States in Europe, North America, and Israel, and supports member States in their efforts towards progress in the SDGs. The Housing and Land Management Unit is secretariat to the UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management. UN-Habitat is the United Nations agency for sustainable urban development, and the focal point for local government within the United Nations system. UN-Habitat serves as lead agency for the implementation and monitoring of the New Urban Agenda (NUA) and Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 11 also known as the “cities’ goal, and the coordination of the UN Systemwide Approach to Sustainable Urbanization.

During the last decade in many countries, urban governance underwent decentralization which resulted in an increased role of local governments in setting policy agendas at the local level. In the light of shrinking public budgets and the legacy of the global financial crisis, the capacity of those local authorities to drive transition towards smart and sustainable cities and localisation of the 2030 Agenda remains often limited. At the same time, digital transformation has posed both opportunities and challenges for policy-makers at national and local levels. Policy-makers can benefit from growing use of e-government, e-governance, e-participation and e-inclusion driven by the supply of new ICT services, yet this requires increased capacity of the authorities to deal with new technologies and new types of data. Challenges are prominent for countries with economies in transition, which have notably limited capacity to develop and implement smart sustainable cities’ strategies.

The project will support transitions of beneficiary selected countries in the UNECE region towards smart and sustainable cities with a view to support implementation of the Goal 11 and other urban related SDGs of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Improved capacities among local and national government officials in five countries in the UNECE region to develop and implement sustainable urban policies will result from (i) evaluation of cities’ performance and (ii) capacity building activities to promote evidence-based policies and the vertical and horizontal coordination between different government

agencies and with participation of cities' inhabitants.

The project will target five cities in countries with economies in transition: Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan; Tbilisi, Georgia; Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan; Grodno, Belarus; and Podgorica, Montenegro. The expected result would be evidenced by each of the participating cities having developed concrete measures, endorsed by the local as well as national governments, to implement recommendations stemming from the smart sustainable city profiles. The project will support achieving SDG 11 "Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable" as well as other SDGs, including SDGs 3, 6, 9, 13 and the New Urban Agenda.

UNECE will lead the project, and UN-Habitat (as implementing partner) will substantively contribute with its expertise on indices and urban monitoring platforms based on the similarities and complementarities of the City Prosperity Index with the Key Performance Indicators for smart sustainable cities.

2. BACKGROUND

2.1. Context

The rate of urbanization is high in the UNECE Region and it is expected to continue to increase. In some parts of the region, where urbanization rates are comparatively low, faster growth can be expected. Urbanization presents a global challenge in terms of the depletion of resources, such as land, clean water and air; and risks to sustainable development (overcrowding in cities, lack of housing accessibility and affordability, effects of the climate change, natural and human-induced disasters, etc.). At the same time, if well planned and managed, cities are and will increasingly become engines for delivering sustainable urban development solutions to address the above mentioned environmental, economic and social challenges. The Habitat III Regional Report for the UNECE Region has identified major urban challenges such as urban concentration and agglomeration of cities into super-cities, ageing, increase in inequalities, lack of access to housing, transportation, energy and water supplies, public services, public participation in decision-making, increase in vulnerabilities to environmental and disaster risks. Addressing negative consequences of these and other trends needs to be organised simultaneously, through close cooperation of national and local governments, international organisations and stakeholders.

During the last decade, urban governance underwent decentralization which resulted in an increase in the importance of the role of local governments. There was a growing use of e-government, e-governance, e-participation and e-inclusion driven by the supply of new ICT services. The smart city definitions at the beginning of 2000s were driven mostly by private sector and therefore they often did not include the sustainability aspects, including the content of urban related SDG. This is why two UN intergovernmental bodies, the UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management and the ITU Focus Group on Smart Sustainable Cities have developed and endorsed in 2015 the following definition of smart sustainable cities: "*A smart sustainable city is an innovative city that uses ICTs and other means to improve quality of life, efficiency of urban operation and services, and competitiveness, while ensuring that it meets the needs of present and future generations with respect to economic, social, environmental as well as cultural aspects*". According to this UN definition and building on the content of SDG 11, the "smart sustainable cities" are those which are inclusive, resilient, safe, sustainable and "more connected".

Fourteen other UN agencies accepted this definition; and based on this definition, the sixteen UN agencies formed the United for Smart Sustainable Cities Initiative (U4SSC) as a global platform of the UN organisations to assist governments in implementing public policies supporting the transition to smart sustainable cities. The UNECE and the International Telecommunication Union (ITU) elaborated Key Performance Indicators for smart sustainable cities¹, which aim to assist cities in achieving SDGs. 200 cities have been evaluated using the KPIs to date. The project will build on the complementary to the Key Performance Indicators for Smart and Sustainable Cities and the indicators of the UN-Habitat-led City Prosperity Index. To date, the City Prosperity Index² has been used in over 530 cities worldwide offering cities from developed and developing countries the possibility to create indicators and baseline information, often for the first time. It also serves to define targets and goals that can support the formulation of evidence-based policies, including the definition of city-visions and long-term plans that are both ambitious, and measurable.

Both Key Performance Indicators for Smart and Sustainable Cities and City Prosperity Index share a range of indicators and a considerable affinity in supporting localization of the SDGs. Having recognised these

¹ <https://www.unece.org/housing-and-land-management/housingpublications/housing-and-land-management-hlm/2017/collection-methodology-for-key-performance-indicators-for-smart-sustainable-cities/docs.html>

² <http://cpi.unhabitat.org/>

similarities and complementarities, the UN agencies will work together in advance of the project to ensure the harmonisation of the KPIs and the CPI towards a joint measurement framework for cities to make them sustainable and smart. Evaluation of performance in the selected project countries with economies in transition will be based on an aligned set of indicators and a harmonised approach to measuring smart and sustainable cities, built on the *One UN principles* and inter-agency consensus.

As evidence demonstrates, there is still a long way for many cities in countries with economies in transition to achieve long-term sustainability. A significant cause of the above is related to a limited capacity of local governments to collect and analyse the data, use the data for evidence-based policy making and ensure proper inter-institutional coordination, both at horizontal and vertical levels. In consequence, municipalities are constrained to steer, plan and led urban development properly. Data and information are a pivotal element to promote effective urban governance frameworks. A full-fledged smart monitoring platform could positively contribute to strengthening the role and leverage of local governments. This project aims to have a direct and positive impact on the selected cities using successful urban monitoring methodologies.

The project will support building capacity of national and local authorities through activities in five cities in the selected countries with economies in transition in the UNECE region: Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan; Tbilisi, Georgia; Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan; Grodno, Belarus; and Podgorica, Montenegro. The cities were selected based on the interests for the cooperation expressed by their city governments and the respective national governments.

2.2. Mandates, comparative advantage and link to the Programme Budget

The implementing entities of the project are Housing and Land Management Unit of the UNECE Forests, Land and Housing Division (UNECE); and the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-HABITAT). UNECE and UN-HABITAT are strategic partners on issues related to urban planning, housing and land management in the UNECE region, given their expertise and complementary mandates in these areas. UNECE representatives of multiple subprogrammes, such as Environment, Energy, Innovation, Transport and others will be involved through the UNECE Nexus on “Sustainable and smart cities for all ages”³ which joins experts working on different aspects of urban and housing issues.

Mandates

The UNECE has a mandate⁴ to facilitate greater economic integration and cooperation among its fifty-six Member States. The Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management is the only intergovernmental body addressing the urban challenges of the UNECE region. Since its establishment in 1947, the Committee has served as a forum for exchange of best practices and providing a platform for policy formulation and implementation on sustainable housing development, land administration and spatial planning. The UNECE subprogramme on housing, land management and population contributes to the advancement of decent, adequate, affordable, energy-efficient and healthy housing for all in liveable cities and human settlements, sustainable land management and evidence-based population and social cohesion policies.

The UNECE Environment subprogramme contributes to the improvement of environmental governance and performance throughout the region for safeguarding the environment and human health. This includes, for instance, the UNECE Water Convention⁵ and its Protocol of Water and Health, which support improved water quality in cities.

The UNECE Transport subprogramme contributes to improve sustainable inland, including urban, transport by making it safer, cleaner, more efficient and more affordable, for both freight transport and personal mobility. The Inland Transport Committee (ITC) is the policy-making body of the UNECE promoting sustainable transport in the UNECE Region. The Transport and Environment subprogrammes in cooperation with the World Health Organisation (WHO) Regional Office for Europe jointly implement THE PEP – the Transport, Health and Environment Pan-European Programme which supports activities promoting sustainable urban development by linking transport, health and the environment.⁶

UN-HABITAT is the United Nations agency for human settlements. It is mandated by the UN General Assembly⁷ to promote socially and environmentally sustainable development of towns and cities with the goal

³ <https://www.unece.org/high-impact-areas/general-introduction.html>

⁴ E/ECE/1434/Rev.1

⁵ <https://www.unece.org/env/water/>

⁶ <https://thepep.unece.org/>

⁷ The main documents outlining the Un-Habitat mandate are the Vancouver Declaration on Human Settlements, http://www.unhabitat.org/downloads/docs/924_21239_The_Vancouver_Declaration.pdf; Habitat Agenda, http://www.unhabitat.org/downloads/docs/1176_6455_The_Habitat_Agenda.pdf; Istanbul Declaration on Human Settlements,

of providing adequate shelter for all. UN-Habitat also has the specific mandate within the United Nation System to act as a focal point for local governments.

Comparative advantages

The two project partners (UNECE and UN-Habitat) have complementing expertise in the field of smart sustainable cities. They also have many years of experience in cooperating with each other in the UNECE Region where multiple successful projects were successfully implemented.

The UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit is secretariat to the Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management which brings together national governments from 56 UNECE member States, as well as stakeholders, including local governments, private sector, NGOs and academia. Since 2007, the Committee's Real Estate Market Advisory Group (REM) includes representatives of the private sector, experts, NGOs and local authorities, and addresses issues of urban development, housing and land administration, also at the local level. Representatives of cities regularly attend the Committee sessions and are actively involved in national and local training events organised by the UNECE. In April 2019, the UNECE organised the "Day of Cities" which brought together representatives of municipalities from over 50 countries of the UNECE region. Annual "Forums of Mayors" are planned to start in 2020, which will serve as a platform for local governments for addressing urban, land and housing issues in the region. The Inland Transport Committee (ITC) provides an intergovernmental forum, where UNECE and other United Nations Member States collectively forge tools for economic cooperation and negotiate and adopt international legal instruments which are indispensable for developing efficient, harmonized and integrated, safe and sustainable inland transport systems. Therefore, the UNECE has an extensive network of national experts in housing, urban development, transport, statistics and energy experts who will provide technical expertise to the pilot cities of the project and will contribute its experience in developing housing, urban development and land management policies and with their expertise to the project implementation. Further, the UNECE is part of the secretariat of the United for Smart Sustainable Cities Initiative (U4SSC). It developed the KPIs for smart sustainable cities and organises KPI evaluation for cities in countries with economies in transition. With its extensive experience of leading regional projects in the UNECE region, UNECE will be the project lead.

UN-Habitat promotes transformative change in cities and human settlements through knowledge, policy advice, technical assistance and collaborative action to leave no one behind. Based in over 90 countries, UN-Habitat promotes the development of socially and environmentally sustainable human settlements and strives for adequate shelters with better living standards for all. In its role as lead and focal point agency for the implementation and monitoring of the New Urban Agenda (NUA) and Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 11, UN-Habitat convenes the New Urban Agenda Platform, to systematize the monitoring of progress on the implementation of the NUA. UN-Habitat develops global norms, policies, standards, and frameworks for sustainable urbanisation, and implements concrete technical projects on the ground with reference to those normative guidelines. UN-Habitat will contribute with its expertise in developing methodologies for data collection and development of evidence-based policies in housing and urban development, urban planning and design and participatory planning. UN-Habitat will be directly engaged at the subnational level with municipalities and academia in the region.

The UNECE Proposed Programme Budget 2020:

At the UNECE, the Project is directly linked to:

Subprogramme 8 "Housing, Land Management and Population" and its objective to advance decent, adequate, affordable, energy efficient and healthy housing for all in liveable cities and human settlements; sustainable land management; and to advance evidence-based population and social cohesion policies.

Subprogramme 1 "Environment" and its objective to improve environmental governance and performance throughout the ECE region for safeguarding the environment and human health.

Subprogramme 2 "Transport" and its objective is to improve sustainable inland transport system, by making it safer, cleaner, more efficient and more affordable, both for freight transport and personal mobility.

Other UNECE Subprogrammes will be involved in the project. The proposed project contributes to the UNECE nexuses "Smart and sustainable cities" and of "Sustainable Mobility and Smart Connectivity".

UN-Habitat

At UN-Habitat, the Project is directly linked to:

Subprogramme 1 “Reduces spatial inequality and poverty in communities across the urban-rural continuum”

Subprogramme 2 “Enhanced shared prosperity of cities and regions” which among other targets aim at (a) increased and equal access to basic services, sustainable mobility and public spaces; (b) increased and secure access to land and adequate and affordable housing; (c) increased spatial connectivity and productivity; (d) increased and equitably distributed locally generated revenues; and (e) expanded development of frontier technologies and innovations.

Subprogramme 7: “Urban Research and Capacity Building” and its expected accomplishments of improved monitoring of global urbanization conditions and trends; improved knowledge of sustainable urbanization issues at the local, national and global levels for evidence-based formulation; and improved capacity of national and local authorities and partners to implement plans or strategies for sustainable urbanization.

Several indicators of SDG 11 are under the custody of these UN-Habitat Subprogrammes which bring a specific value added to the project.

2.3 Country demand and beneficiary countries

The cities where the project will be implemented are Bishkek (Kyrgyzstan), Grodno (Belarus), Nur-Sultan (Kazakhstan), Podgorica (Montenegro) and Tbilisi (Georgia). The selected countries represent four different UNECE sub-regions – Eastern Europe (Belarus), South-Eastern Europe (Montenegro), Caucasus (Georgia) and Central Asia (Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan). All countries and cities clearly stated interest in and demand for the project. The wide geographical coverage will facilitate the transfer of knowledge across the UNECE region as well as exchange of best practices and cooperation at sub-regional and regional level.

The cities were selected based on the interests for the cooperation expressed by their city governments and the respective national governments as explained below.

Subregion – South-Eastern Europe

Podgorica, Montenegro

The Government of Montenegro and the city government of Podgorica are active in promoting green economy and sustainable urban development which are key government priorities. There is high political support for the smart sustainable city approaches. The Mayor of City of Podgorica Mr. Ivan Vukovic attended [the UNECE Day of Cities](#) in Geneva in April 2019 and expressed interest to cooperate on sustainable urban development and planning topics.

It is expected Podgorica will be able to implement the project with high quality. After the project is implemented, its experiences can be scaled up in other cities in South-Eastern Europe, and the Podgorica city government will be able to provide its support and capacity building to other cities in the subregion.

The project in Podgorica will build on the earlier completed projects and studies. In 2015, the UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management cooperated with the Government of Montenegro to address urban sprawl; a report on “Formalizing the Informal: Challenges and Opportunities of Informal Settlements in South-East Europe” with the analysis of the issues in Montenegro was prepared. In 2018-2019 supported by UNECE, the government conducted needs assessment in achieving SDGs based on the recommendations provided in the Third Environmental Performance Review (EPR) of Montenegro, published by UNECE in 2015. Based on the assessment conducted, the government is working to integrate environmental policies into sector-specific and cross-sectoral strategies aimed at the achievement of SDGs, including in relation to urban development. The UNECE workshop “Sustainable urban transport and mobility: Policies and practices on the basis of UNECE Environmental Performance Reviews” (Budva, Montenegro, 18 - 19 June 2019) provided a platform for countries of Eastern and South Eastern Europe, including Montenegro, to share their experiences in addressing sustainable transport issues and to support cooperation between the relevant experts for transport and environment. The work within the project will build on the above-mentioned efforts and will promote further policy integration on urban development, addressing informal developments, preventing urban sprawl and improving environmental quality in City of Podgorica.

Subregion – Central Asia

Two cities were selected for the project in Central Asia – Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan; and Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan; one larger and one smaller city. Kyrgyzstan is one of the poorest land-locked countries in the UNECE region where city governments require support to overcome acute challenges related to urban sprawl, informal settlements, low access to affordable housing and poor urban planning. Bishkek, the capital, is a comparatively small city suffering from urban sprawl, unaffordable housing, poor urban infrastructure and the project will address these important challenges. Experience of the project implementation is relevant to cities in Tajikistan and secondary cities in all Central Asian states where the Bishkek project experience can be replicated.

Nur-Sultan is a capital of Kazakhstan and has already gained experience in developing different smart city approaches, including in energy efficiency, management of multiapartment buildings, urban transport, etc. However, often these solutions are developed with the view of short-term gains and there is a limited capacity of local authorities to support the technological solution and urban infrastructure developed long-term. It is also important to note that Nur-Sultan is in the area with highly continental climate with great differences in air temperatures between winter and summer; the city is prone to natural disasters and climate change. Therefore, there is a need to support to the city authorities to promote city climate adaptation through smart city solution in buildings, transport, urban infrastructure. Nur-Sultan in addition will serve as a good practice for the city of Bishkek so that experts in Nur-Sultan could provide additional resources to support capacity building of local authorities and experts in Bishkek. Experience of the implementation of the project in Nur-Sultan will be relevant to many large cities not only in Eastern Europe and Central Asia but all across the UNECE region because Nur-Sultan is putting lots of investments into smart sustainable cities projects and its authorities are ready to experiment and not to make mistakes.

In summary, the project in Nur-Sultan could be a very good example of the smart sustainable city project implementation for the whole UNECE region with special relevance to larger cities within Kazakhstan as well as for cities in Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan. The Bishkek project experiences will be useful for smaller cities in Central Asia, Caucasus and Central Asia, especially in Tajikistan, the least developed country with informal settlements and urban sprawl.

Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan

Cooperation in Nur-sultan will build on outcomes of the Country Profile on the Housing Sector of Kazakhstan which was prepared by the UNECE in cooperation with UN-Habitat during 2016-2018. The Country Profile emphasized the importance of the engagement of national partners in the design of local urban innovation strategies and engagement with public and private international partners and organizations. The UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit (HLM) jointly with its partners, UN-Habitat, UN ESCAP, UNDP Kazakhstan, conducted several capacity building workshops in Kazakhstan to support the government to implement Country Profile recommendations. As a result of these discussions, the Government invited UNECE to initiate a joint pilot project on innovative financing of a residential district “Zhastar”. The first scoping mission was conducted in September 2018 to establish a strategic direction of this pilot project. This work will continue in 2019-2020 as part of a bilateral assistance project supported by the Russian Federation. This project will further build on experiences of already implemented projects, including the described above.

Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan

The UNECE and UN-Habitat supported the Government of Kyrgyzstan in implementing policy recommendations of the Country Profile on Housing and Urban Development (2010) through multiple capacity building workshops and pilot projects. Progress of the development of urban development policies in Kyrgyzstan was presented in the joint UNECE-UN-Habitat publication “CIS Cities: Towards Sustainable Future - The Commonwealth of Independent States Regional Report” (2016). The report showed the need to continue working especially on better planning of the housing sector at local level. In 2019, the Agency of Construction and Architecture of Kyrgyzstan and the City Government of Bishkek requested UNECE and UN-Habitat to develop an action plan for Bishkek for affordable and energy efficient housing urban planning, with a focus on promoting adaptation to climate change. In response in 2019, the UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management and UN-Habitat discussed potential cooperation and formulated specific recommendations which will be the basis for the pilot activities in the city of Bishkek.

Subregion – Southern Caucasus

Tbilisi, Georgia

The Georgian government at national and local level has demonstrated achievements in promoting smart sustainable cities approaches through high-class urban planning in the city of Batumi and building capacity of municipalities through multiple donor and government funding projects. The City Government of Tbilisi is still lacking an integrated approach to the implementation of smart sustainable cities solutions. Once completed, Georgia’s experiences will be useful for many cities in Caucasus and Eastern Europe in the future.

The Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia, Ministry of Regional Development and Innovation and UNECE organised capacity building workshops in 2013 and in 2016 where discussed issues of energy efficient and affordable housing, spatial planning and green urban development. The City of Tbilisi was actively involved in this work and the city government expressed interest to conduct the KPI evaluation and pilot projects on planning urban infrastructure. In June 2019, UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management organised together with the Government a joint training workshop with the Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure, the Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development and Georgian Land Registry on evidence-based housing and urban policies and sustainable infrastructure. As a result, the partners have agreed to develop a joint initiative on urban planning of housing and infrastructure in cities. The project activities will build on the cooperation so far. It will also build on the commitment of the City Government of Tbilisi to cooperate. Ms. Maia Bitadze, Deputy Mayor of Tbilisi, attended [the UNECE Day of Cities](#) in Geneva in April 2019 and expressed commitment of her city to cooperate on sustainable urban planning.

Subregion- Eastern Europe

Grodno, Belarus

Regional and local governments of City of Grodno have expressed high political commitment to smart sustainable cities solution, with well organised city and regional governments system. This is an important factor for the success of the project and is likely to be replicated in other cities in Belarus in future. In Grodno in May 2018, the Government of Belarus expressed interest in implementing a joint pilot project on the establishment of a smart sustainable district in Grodno, which would support the implementation of the Country Profile recommendations and will build capacity of the government and stakeholders for their implementation. The Ministry of Construction and Architecture of Belarus has selected a new “green” buildings development district in the city of Grodno as a future smart sustainable pilot district for the project. Planning and preparation of the cooperation for the pilot project at district level in 2019-2020 will be conducted within a bilateral assistance project supported by the Russian Federation. However, this project will focus only on one district of the city and will not involve the KPI/CPI evaluation. The Country Profile on Housing and Land Management of Belarus has been prepared by UNECE in cooperation with UN-Habitat in 2017-2019, and the policy recommendations are available in (ECE/HBP/2018/4). The study recommends promoting involvement of private funding into building and modernisation to promote available affordability of decent housing to the population. The proposed project will further promote synergies and build on achievement of the mentioned project.

2.4 Link to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

The project will primarily support achieving **Sustainable Development Goal 11** – “Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable” and more specifically the following targets:

Target 11.1: “By 2030, ensure access for all to adequate, safe and affordable housing and basic services and upgrade slums”. This will be enabled through support to Bishkek city government to develop action plan for affordable and energy efficient housing urban planning. In all the cities recommendations for adequate, safe and affordable housing will be formulated based on the KPI evaluation.

Target 11.3: “By 2030, enhance inclusive and sustainable urbanization and capacity for participatory, integrated and sustainable human settlement planning and management in all countries”. This will be enabled through provision of capacity building workshops in all beneficiary cities/countries which will include recommendations for integrated cities’ planning as well as providing capacity building activities for developing projects, which will be based on people-first PPPs, include components on stakeholder participation and be fit for the innovative (inclusive) financing mechanisms.

Target 11.5: “By 2030, significantly reduce the number of deaths and the number of people affected and substantially decrease the direct economic losses relative to global gross domestic product caused by disasters, including water-related disasters, with a focus on protecting the poor and people in vulnerable situations”. This will be enabled through a number of activities in beneficiary cities/countries, specifically: development of the action plan on urban planning for Bishkek with the focus on adaptation to climate change; the work on Podgorica (Montenegro) city evaluation and the follow-up thematic policy package focusing on green economy; in Tbilisi, Georgia a special focus will be given to energy use, climate neutrality and environmental protection.

Target 11.7: “By 2030, provide universal access to safe, inclusive and accessible, green and public spaces, in particular for women and children, older persons and persons with disabilities”. This will be enabled through the recommendations which will be provided to all five beneficiary cities/countries, based on the assessment of cities’ sustainability status. Given that within this project, the smart sustainable city is defined as “*an innovative*

city that uses ICTs and other means to improve quality of life, efficiency of urban operation and services, and competitiveness, while ensuring that it meets the needs of present and future generations with respect to economic, social, environmental as well as cultural aspects” all the elements mentioned in the target are assessed for the cities, and provided an outlook for development opportunities.

Target 11.a: “Support positive economic, social and environmental links between urban, per-urban and rural areas by strengthening national and regional development planning”. The project assumes close collaboration between city and national governments in the beneficiary cities/countries. Moreover, whenever applicable (i.e. Kazakhstan, Belarus, Montenegro), the recommendations for city urban legislation will be based on the principle of harmonization with national sustainable urban development plans and strategies.

Target 11.c: “Support least developed countries, including through financial and technical assistance, in building sustainable and resilient buildings utilizing local materials”. All beneficiary cities/countries will receive capacity building and practical case-by-case support for developing concrete sustainable city projects, and attracting investors through the innovative financing mechanisms.

Sustainable Development Goal 3

Target 3.6: “By 2020, halve the number of global deaths and injuries from road traffic accidents.”; This will be enabled with the help of recommendations which will be provided to the beneficiary cities on their sustainability profiles. The evaluation methodologies cover the aspect of transport and road safety, and therefore support recommendation on improvement of this segment, where applicable.

Target 3.9: “By 2030, substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution and contamination”. This will be enabled with the help of recommendations which will be provided to the beneficiary cities on their sustainability profiles. The evaluation methodologies cover the aspect of air pollution, water pollution and waste management, and therefore support recommendation on improvement of this segment, where applicable.

Sustainable Development Goal 6

Target 6.1: “By 2030, achieve universal and equitable access to safe and affordable drinking water for all”

Target 6.2: “By 2030, achieve access to adequate and equitable sanitation and hygiene for all”

Target 6.3: “By 2030, improve water quality by reducing pollution, eliminating dumping and minimizing release of hazardous chemicals and materials, halving the proportion of untreated wastewater and substantially increasing recycling and safe reuse globally”.

The above-mentioned targets will be enabled through the recommendations provided to the beneficiary cities/countries based on the sustainability evaluation of the cities, which includes assessment of water management (consumption, pollution, wastewater management).

Sustainable Development Goal 9

Target 9.1.: “Develop quality, reliable, sustainable and resilient infrastructure, including regional and transborder infrastructure, to support economic development and human well-being, with a focus on affordable and equitable access for all”.

Target 9.4: “By 2030, upgrade infrastructure and retrofit industries to make them sustainable, with increased resource-use efficiency and greater adoption of clean and environmentally sound technologies and industrial processes, with all countries taking action in accordance with their respective capabilities”

These targets are directly reflected in expected outcomes for beneficiary cities/ countries, specifically through: development of action plan for affordable and energy efficient housing urban planning for the city of Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan; promoting innovation and innovative financing mechanisms in the development of housing and urban infrastructure for the city of Grodno, Belarus; supporting Tbilisi, Georgia with integrated urban planning of the city; focusing on innovative financing and addressing climate change for Nursultan, Kazakhstan; in supporting the development of legal framework to implement green economy approach on city level for Podgorica, Montenegro.

Sustainable Development Goal 13

Target 13.1: “Strengthen resilience and adaptive capacity to climate-related hazards and natural disasters in all countries”.

Target 13.2: “Integrate climate change measures into national policies, strategies and planning”.

Target 13.3: “Improve education, awareness-raising and human and institutional capacity on climate change mitigation, adaptation, impact reduction and early warning”.

The above indicated targets will be enabled through focusing on the topics of environmental protection (Tbilisi, GE), green economy (Podgorica Montenegro), addressing and promoting adaptation to climate change (Nursultan, KZ and Bishkek, KG)

2.5 Innovative aspects

The project accounts growing use of e-government, e-governance, e-participation and e-inclusion that has been driven by digitalisation, especially the supply of new ICT services, and promotes further digital transformation of national and local economies and improving smartness of cities in the UNECE region. It builds on these developments and further supports effective implementation of these innovative approaches and technologies in countries with economies in transition. Digital transformation is one of the key aspects of the Key Performance Indicators for Smart Sustainable cities and underpins its methodology.

The project will support access to smart technologies while promoting inclusive sustainable urban development and well-being for all people, especially those most vulnerable. It should be noted that the smart city definitions over the last two decades were driven mostly by the private sector often did not include the issues of sustainability, human rights, and gender parity. This project will support implementation the following UN definition of smart sustainable cities: “A *smart sustainable city is an innovative city that uses ICTs and other means to improve quality of life, efficiency of urban operation and services, and competitiveness, while ensuring that it meets the needs of present and future generations with respect to economic, social, environmental as well as cultural aspects*”.⁸

The project deploys a comprehensive KPI framework for the use of policy-makers at national and local levels. The KPIs are a self-assessment tool helping cities to identify strengths and weaknesses in order to improve a city’s performance. Data and evidence developed as a result of the KPI evaluation then can be used by cities to set priorities for sustainable growth and provides a ground for better investment decisions. Within the project, policy-makers at national and local levels are further encouraged to use the KPI framework as a monitoring tool to evaluate the changes in the city’s performance over a certain period and after actions have been implemented.

Finally the project will apply the KPIs⁹ for smart sustainable cities in relation to five cities in five different countries. This approach opens opportunities for further comparison and benchmarking within the UNECE region . Hence, it can serve as a blueprint for how comparative evaluations can be done as part of other projects implemented in the UNECE region.

The KPIs are fully aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and support assessment, monitoring and achievement of the SDGs at the local level. Data generated as a result of the evaluation will help the cities in achieving their sustainable development and smart city goals and will provide insights to the national governments to help strengthen national and international policy and strategy relating to SDGs. Through the use of the city-level indicators for smart and sustainable cities, the project will contribute to better harmonization of local and national data production and/or collection processes, which is a backbone of a review of implementation of the 2030 Agenda in the UNECE region; and will contribute to the improvement of urban monitoring at the city level.

3. ANALYSIS

3.1 Situation analysis

Many cities in the countries with economies in transition have poor urban infrastructure. The 2008 financial and economic crisis has made middle-income households in greater need for affordable housing, especially in cities. At least 100 million low-and middle-income earners in the UNECE region are housing-cost overburdened,

⁸ https://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/hlm/documents/2015/ECE_HBP_2015_4.en.pdf

⁹ The harmonised system of city performance measurement which will be developed based on KPIs and CPIs and to be endorsed by partners of the United for Smart Sustainable Cities.

meaning that they spend more than 40% of their disposable income on accommodation. Considering the limited housing supply and the sharp drop in new housing starts and completion since 2008, ensuring of the quality of the existing stock and establishing energy efficiency standards for new stock are increasingly important. So far, governments from these countries have not been able to elaborate working innovative financial mechanisms to support inhabitants in obtaining credits, which would allow them to afford housing.

At city level, housing and urban infrastructure is affected by the absence of city planning based on principles of compact, resilient spatial development. As a result, municipal infrastructure is becoming rapidly outdated, informal settlements are growing, and the human settlements are prone to, and suffer from natural disasters such as floods and landslides. Limited access to affordable, healthy and energy-efficient housing and inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable cities is underlined by the insufficient capacity of national governments to develop and implement evidence-based housing and urban development policies tailored to their policy objectives.

Development of these capacities is especially important in order to promote effective implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, which stresses the importance of strong monitoring and accountability systems, to ensure the long-term sustainability of the implementation of policies.

The development of capacities of local authorities to conduct evaluation of the cities' performance will also help the local governments to assess their strengths and weaknesses. By analysing the performance of a city against the KPIs, it is easier to recognize which areas are most critical or in which areas the city is performing well. An alignment and harmonization exercise will be undertaken of the KPI and the CPI led by UN-Habitat. The project will also use the results of the joint UNECE-UN-Habitat 10th tranche project "Evidence-based policies for sustainable housing and urban development in selected countries with economies in transition" where possible.

KPI evaluation will assist cities to set priorities for action. Once the strengths and the weaknesses of the cities are identified, the indicators can help to prioritize, that is, to choose the most critical issues for the sustainable growth of the city and a course of action against the alternatives, and to define suitable response measures. Indicators are also a good monitoring tool to evaluate changes in the city's performance over time.

Outcomes of the evaluation of cities will provide insights into progress made towards the 2030 Agenda. The KPIs are fully aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and support the achievement of the SDGs at the local level. Having standardised data for pilot cities according to an international framework created to support the localization of the 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development will support participating governments to monitor and track progress line with the SDGs. Municipal data can be aggregated to the regional, provincial and national level for SDGs monitoring and benchmarking at the global level. Using the above-mentioned city level KPIs to monitor progress towards SDGs will help pilot countries to make smarter and more sustainable decisions and policies and provide its cities and communities with a participatory and bottom-up approach critical to making sustainable progress.

Often, smart city solutions are used mostly by wealthier groups of the population. To ensure "no one is left behind", the KPI city performance evaluation will include stakeholder consultations with participation of women, NGOs, young people and other representatives of vulnerable groups. They will be encouraged to give feedback to the City Evaluation Reports (city profiles), with a view to include their perspectives in the City Evaluation Reports (city profiles) and to ensure that vulnerable groups benefit from smart cities solutions.

The project is addressing the needs of the vulnerable groups through including consideration for their well-being and inclusion in the recommendations of the evaluation of cities to make them more sustainable and liveable. For example the recommendations based on KPI evaluation will address the issue of inclusive urban and infrastructure planning, which includes city security (helps safety of vulnerable populations), access of infrastructure by persons with disabilities, ensuring green zones in urban planning (addressing needs of youth for places where they can exercise and spend their leisure, as well as the needs of elderly – who can benefit from these areas for the purpose of recreation).

3.2 Country level problem analysis

Table 1. Country-City analysis

City	Status of Affair	Realistic Outcome
<p>Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan</p>	<p>SDG 11 and especially target 11.1. in affordable housing is one of central topics for the government work on SDG implementation. The Government of Kyrgyzstan will develop its Volunteer National Review by 2020.</p> <p>The Government of Kyrgyzstan does not have a policy on affordable housing, is developing it now; it requested the UN support to develop a multiyear programme on planning housing at city level for Bishkek city as a model project which could be replicated in other cities in Kyrgyzstan and in other countries.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What progress has already been made or what steps have been taken to address this issue? <p>The UNECE Country Profile on the Housing Sector of Kyrgyzstan was prepared in 2010. Following the publication of the report, the UNECE supported the Government in implementing policy recommendations through several capacity building workshops.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What (if any) support are other UN agencies and other development partners providing to address this issue? <p>Progress of the development of urban development policies in Kyrgyzstan was presented in the joint UNECE-UN-Habitat publication “CIS Cities: Towards Sustainable Future - The Commonwealth of Independent States Regional Report” (2016). The report showed the need to continue working especially on better planning of the housing sector at local level. UN-Habitat and UNECE further supported capacity building of authorities through workshops and support to travels to relevant international meetings.</p> <p>The Agency of Construction and Architecture of Kyrgyzstan and the City Government of Bishkek requested in 2019 the UNECE and UN-Habitat to develop an action plan for Bishkek for affordable and energy efficient housing urban planning, with a focus on promoting adaptation to climate change.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ What are the principle assets the country has in addressing the issue? <p>The country government has political will to address the issue, qualified staff and experts in national government, local government and relevant academic institutions. There is a functioning market of real estate.</p>	<p>Based on the request by the Government, the project will start with the KPI evaluation of Bishkek city. The City Evaluation Report (city profiles) will be prepared which will identify the areas where action is required most urgently and give direction to the types of investments that are needed to address the gaps and weaknesses.</p> <p>A validation workshop will be organised.</p> <p>A thematic policy package will be developed focusing on planning housing development at city level for City of Bishkek.</p> <p>Capacity building workshops will be organised, including a local validation workshop, to validate smart sustainable the City Evaluation Report (city profile) outcomes; and a capacity building workshop to train national and local authorities to support the implementation of the City Evaluation Report (city profile) recommendations and in the in the use of the online tool which will provide a policy simulation for smart sustainable city solutions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What change will happen? <p>Based on the concrete set of recommendations, the local government of City of Bishkek will elaborate the strategic plan for housing development in the city. The implementation will make Bishkek a smarter, more sustainable and liveable city.</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the principle gaps to be addressed? <p>However, there is no strategy for how to address the issue of urban sprawl; no sufficient technical skills in how to address management of existing housing and planning of the new housing.</p> <p>To respond to the request, in 2019, the UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management and UN-Habitat discussed with the two agencies possible avenue of the cooperation and formulated specific recommendations which will be the basis for the activities in the city of Bishkek.</p>	
Podgorica, Montenegro	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ What progress has already been made or what steps have been taken to address this issue? <p>The Government of Montenegro and the city government of Podgorica are active to promote green economy and sustainable urban development; these topics are recognized as government priorities for urban development. The 2016 VNR of Montenegro outlined the following vision for the implementation of the 2030 Agenda: “Promotion of the concept of sustainable economic development that includes: health, education, a healthy environment and the sustainability of natural resources, socially responsible behaviour, social inclusion and good governance”. The Government adopted in 2016 National Strategy on Sustainable Development which supported the above priorities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What (if any) support are other UN agencies and other development partners providing to address this issue? <p>UNECE supported with the preparation of a report on “Formalizing the Informal: Challenges and Opportunities of Informal Settlements in South-East Europe” which contains an analysis of the issues in Montenegro; developed Needs Assessment in achieving SDGs based on the recommendations provided in the Third Environmental Performance Review (EPR). ILO prepared a survey report on green economy and green jobs in Montenegro in 2017.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the principle assets the country has in addressing the issue? <p>The government has political will, an adequate legal framework to implement the green economy approach. It is working to integrate environmental policies into sector-specific and cross-sectoral strategies aimed at the achievement of SDGs, including in relation to urban development.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the principle gaps to be addressed? 	<p>A smart sustainable the City Evaluation Report (city profile) based on the KPI evaluation with recommendations will be developed. The city profile will identify the areas where action is required most urgently and give direction to the types of investments that are needed to address the gaps and weaknesses.</p> <p>The work on city evaluation will especially focus on green economy, which is the government priority.</p> <p>At least one follow-up thematic policy package will be developed focusing on green economy. This will be a concrete example at city level for implementation of the National Strategy for Sustainable Development.</p> <p>Capacity building workshops will be organised, including a local validation workshop to validate smart sustainable the City Evaluation Report (city profile) outcomes; and a capacity-development workshop. The training workshop will support the implementation of the City Evaluation Report (city profile) recommendations and the use of the online tool which will provide a policy simulation for smart sustainable city solutions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The change that will happen <p>As a result of the project implementation, a concrete policy package, an investment programme or an action plan at city level will be developed by the local government which will implement the National Strategy and will build on capacity of local authorities’ development within the project. Implementation of the policy package will make Podgorica a smarter, more sustainable and liveable city.</p> <p>.</p>

	<p>There is still a lack of best practices of implementation of the national strategy at city level, especially for integration of different sectoral policies/ The project will build on these efforts and will promote further policy integration on urban development, addressing informal developments, preventing urban sprawl and improving environmental quality in City of Podgorica.</p>	
<p>Tbilisi, Georgia</p>	<p>The project will build on the strategic vision of the Government of Georgia reflected in the 2016 VNR (the next VNR will be published in 2020), which is integration of the economic, social and environmental directions of sustainable development and special focus on energy use and environmental protection.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What progress has already been made or what steps have been taken to address this issue? <p>The Government developed National Strategy for Sustainable Development. Following which the Georgian Parliament adopted in 2019 Parliamentary Strategy/Action Plan on implementation and monitoring of SDGs. Interministerial coordination was established. However, no detailed strategy related to urban planning was elaborated yet.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What (if any) support are other UN agencies and other development partners providing to address this issue? <p>To support the implementation of the SDGs, Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia and the UNECE organised capacity building workshops in 2016 where discussed issues of energy efficient and affordable housing; spatial planning and green urban development. The City of Tbilisi was actively involved in this work and the city government expressed its interest to conduct the KPI evaluation and pilot projects on planning urban infrastructure. In June 2019, UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management has organised together with the Government a joint training workshop with the Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure, the Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development and Georgian Land Registry on evidence-based housing and urban policies and sustainable infrastructure. As a result, the partners have agreed to develop a joint initiative on urban planning of housing and infrastructure in cities. The project activities will build on the cooperation so far.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the principle assets the country has in addressing the issue? <p>The Government has a well-coordinated strategy for promoting sustainable development, an</p>	<p>The project will build on the strategic vision of the Government of Georgia reflected in the 2016 VNR to promote strategic integrated planning of cities.</p> <p>A smart sustainable City Evaluation Report based on the KPI evaluation with recommendations will be developed. The city profile will identify the areas where action is required most urgently and give direction to the types of investments that are needed to address the gaps and weaknesses. The recommendations will especially focus on issues of integrated urban planning of cities.</p> <p>At least one follow-up thematic policy package will be developed related to the integrated urban planning. The policy packages will be concrete proposals for projects, including for investments; they will be prepared by the respective local governments to ensure the ownership with advice from the UNECE and UN-Habitat and further will be consulted with representatives of national governments.</p> <p>Capacity building workshop will be organised, and a local validation workshop will be organised to validate smart sustainable City Evaluation Report (city profile) outcomes; and a capacity-development workshop to train national and local authorities to support the implementation of the City Evaluation Report (city profile) recommendations and to use the online tool which will provide a policy simulation for smart sustainable city solutions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The change that will happen <p>As a result of the project implementation, a concrete policy package, .e. an investment programme or an action plan at city level will be developed by the local government which will implement the National Strategy and will build on capacity of local authorities' development within the project. Implementation of the policy package will make Tbilisi a smarter, more sustainable and liveable city.</p>

	<p>interagency coordination mechanism. There is strong political will for implementation.</p> <p>What are the principle gaps to be addressed?</p> <p>Lack of capacity of the local authorities for the implementation of national strategy, especially those related to urban planning and development.</p>	
<p>Grodno, Belarus</p>	<p>The Belarus VNR of 2017 focused on the SDGs 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 9. Among related priorities are topics of health and well-being based on clean environment, high-quality education and addressing climate change.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ What progress has already been made or what steps have been taken to address this issue <p>The government developed and adopted a comprehensive set of legislation promoting smart sustainable urban development (please see Country Profile publication for the list).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What (if any) support are other UN agencies and other development partners providing to address this issue? <p>The Country Profile on Housing and Land Management of Belarus has been prepared by UNECE in cooperation with UN-Habitat in 2017-2019, outlines concrete proposals for future activities to promote well-being through affordable decent housing and integrated urban planning. The Government of Belarus at a workshop in Grodno in May 2018 expressed its interest in implementing a joint pilot project on the establishment of a smart sustainable district in Grodno, Belarus, which would support the implementation of the Country Profile recommendations and will build capacity of the government and stakeholders to their implementation. The Ministry of Construction and Architecture of Belarus has selected a new “green” buildings development district in the city of Grodno as a future smart sustainable pilot district for the project. Planning and preparation of the cooperation for the pilot project at district level in 2019-2020 will be conducted within a bilateral assistance project supported by the Russian Federation; this project however will focus only on one district of the city and will not involve the KPI/CPI evaluation. The proposed project will further promote synergies and build on achievement of the mentioned project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ What are the principle assets the country has in addressing the issue? <p>The country has developed legal and institutional framework, stability of the government, strong political commitment to achieving SDGs, there is</p>	<p>The project will support the implementation of the government priorities as reflected in 2017 VNR: promoting environmental sustainability in cities while ensuring economic growth.</p> <p>A smart sustainable City Evaluation Report will be developed. It will identify the areas where action is required most urgently and give direction to the types of investments that are needed to address the gaps and weaknesses.</p> <p>At least one follow-up thematic policy package will be developed. This will focus on promoting innovation and innovative financing mechanisms in the development of housing and urban infrastructure.</p> <p>Capacity building workshops will be organised, including a local validation workshop to validate smart sustainable City Evaluation Report (city profile) outcomes; and a capacity-development workshop to train national and local authorities to support the implementation of the City Evaluation Report (city profile) recommendations and the online tool which will provide a policy simulation for smart sustainable city solutions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The change that will happen <p>As a result of the project implementation, a concrete policy package focusing on innovation and innovative financial mechanisms, for instance, an investment programme, will be developed by the local government. Implementation of the policy package will make City of Grodno a smarter, more sustainable and liveable city.</p>

	<p>also high capacity of technical experts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the principle gaps to be addressed? <p>The studies demonstrated that the gaps are in lack of innovation and market mechanisms to support housing and urban infrastructure, lack of involvement of private sector.</p>	
<p>Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What progress has already been made or what steps have been taken to address this issue? <p>Kazakhstan prepared its VNR in 2019 which is focusing on economic development through innovation and development of human capacity.</p> <p>The government also adopted ambitious economic development programmes: "Kazakhstan-2050" Strategy, The strategic plan for the development of Kazakhstan until 2025; and the 100 concrete steps - to implement the five institutional reforms. Innovation through education and institutional reforms are in the heart of the ongoing reforms.</p> <p>City of Nur-Sultan is developing the city strategy for the period of 2050 which is based on promotion of innovation, smart city technologies, environment and climate change. The city of Nur-Sultan also promotes tools for innovative financing of urban infrastructure, including PPP. The project will build on the priorities identified by the government.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What (if any) support are other UN agencies and other development partners providing to address this issue? <p>Cooperation in Nur-Sultan will build on policy recommendations of the Country Profile on the Housing Sector of Kazakhstan which was prepared by the UNECE in cooperation with UN-Habitat during 2016-2018. The Country Profile emphasized the importance of the engagement of national partners in the design of local urban innovation strategies and engagement with public and private international partners and organizations. The UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit (HLM) jointly with its partners, UN-Habitat, UN ESCAP, UNDP Kazakhstan, conducted several capacity building workshops in Kazakhstan to support the government to implement Country Profile recommendations. As a result of these discussions, the Government invited UNECE HLM to initiate a joint pilot project on innovative financing of a residential district "Zhastar". The first scoping mission was conducted by the UNECE in September 2018 to establish a strategic direction of this pilot project. This work will continue in 2019-2020 within a bilateral assistance project supported by the Russian</p>	<p>A smart sustainable City Evaluation Report (city profile) based on the KPI evaluation with recommendations will be developed. The City Evaluation Report (city profile) will identify the areas where action is required most urgently and give direction to the types of investments that are needed to address the gaps and weaknesses.</p> <p>At least one follow-up thematic policy package will be developed. It will be following the priorities of the government on innovative financing and addressing climate change challenges.</p> <p>Capacity building workshops will be organised, including a local validation workshop to validate smart sustainable City Evaluation Report (city profile) outcomes; and a capacity-development workshop to train national and local authorities to support the implementation of the City Evaluation Report (city profile) recommendations. The workshop will also train in the use of the online tool which will provide a policy simulation for smart sustainable city solutions.</p> <p>This will allow building capacity of national and local authorities to the evaluation and using the evaluation results to develop evidence-based policies.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The change that will happen <p>As a result of the project implementation, a concrete policy package, .e. an investment programme at a city district level will be elaborated by the local government and will build on capacity of local authorities' development within the project. Implementation of the policy package will make Nursultan a smarter, more sustainable and liveable city.</p>

	<p>Federation; this however will not include the KPI/CPI evaluation. The UNDA project will further build on experiences of already implemented projects, including the described above.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the principle assets the country has in addressing the issue? Dynamic economy, highly educated human resources, national investments, political commitment. • What are the principle gaps to be addressed? At city level there is need in more intersectoral cooperation , cooperation with academia for better analysis and development of frameworks for foreign investments. 	
--	---	--

3.3 Stakeholder analysis and capacity assessment

The competencies of the federal/national governments include formulating policies and legislation, establishing norms and standards and providing finance and subsidies for urban development. National governments have shared responsibilities with regional and local governments, as well as with the private sector, for providing social or affordable housing, approving urban plans, and investing in urban infrastructure.

Local governments are at the forefront of policy implementation. Management of housing and urban planning issues is the responsibility of local governments, who are responsible for the following: providing and managing urban infrastructure; managing public land for housing purposes, providing social housing and their management; managing the territory by setting sectoral urban regulations, approving urban plans and enforcing regulations; managing waiting lists for social housing; and delivering capacity-building programmes. Local governments also have shared roles with national governments primarily in providing subsidies for housing and with the private sector in condominium management.

The private sector plays a critical role in providing loans for housing, urban infrastructure and management services for condominiums. It is also engaged in investments in urban infrastructure, water and sanitation, which shows a trend towards public-private partnerships, most probably implemented through concessions. Not-for-profit organizations play an important role in providing management services for social housing or condominiums and in social housing and capacity-building. Please see more in Table 2.

Table 2 – Stakeholder Analysis

Non-UN Stakeholder	Type and level of involvement in the project	Capacity assets	Capacity gaps	Desired future outcomes	Incentives
National housing and urban authorities, also ministries and national agencies of finance, energy, environment economic	Responsible for formulating policies and legislation, establishing norms and standards and providing subsidies for housing	The national authorities have mandates to develop and implement related policies.	Weak or lack of the coordination between sectoral agencies and lack of capacity of cooperating with local governments to support smart sustainable urban development.	Strengthened capacities to intersectoral coordination and cooperation with local authorities	Increased resources for the joint implementation of urban policies

development					
Local authorities	Lead implementation of the projects. Share roles with national governments in providing subsidies for housing and urban development	Resources: local taxes, strong knowledge of the local housing and urban development situation and local stakeholders	Lack of capacity to develop and implement city projects. Lack of capacity to collect and analyse data on city development. Lack of budgets for support of housing and urban development projects; lack of capacity for providing input to national governments for the development of the legal and institutional frameworks	Stronger cooperation with national authorities on the development and implementation of urban development policies. Increased capacities for the policy development and project planning and implementation	To be more involved into the central decision-making process . to obtain through innovative financing schemes more resources for urban projects which will improve quality of life of people.
Private sector: condominium management associations	Shared responsibilities with national and local governments for construction of urban infrastructure, providing social or affordable housing	Practical experience in managing housing	If appropriate laws are not adopted by the national governments, it is difficult for the private sector to be involved in urban development. If no legislation giving guarantee for sustainable investments, private sector will not invest. Lack of involvement of private sector in consultations on the development of the legislation and regulations. Lack of capacity of private sector to work through PPPs with local governments.	With the improved legal and institutional framework reflecting needs of private sector at national and local level, higher capacity to PPPs, the private sector will be involved more effectively	To be involved into the implementation phase of the policies
Private sector: banks	Shared responsibilities with national and local governments for offering loans for housing purposes, and investing in urban infrastructure	Knowledge of housing financial and institutional frameworks, especially the areas needed to be improved. Availability of funds to participate in state subsidised mortgage schemes, etc.	Lack of government support in terms of providing the required framework stimulating banks to provide loans to private sector companies –no government guarantees. Absence of incentives by the governments to private banks to provide subsidies to local authorities, SMEs and homeowner organisations to support urban projects. Often projects are very small or high-risks and	Provision of tailored services to the population in need of social or affordable housing and urban infrastructure. When government establishes favourable legal framework and provides guarantees, local authorities and relevant stakeholder	To invest funds into the beneficial projects; to promote better economic development in cities which will further facilitate the use of future investments

			there is need in, first, packaging of projects; second, in government guarantees.	organisations can request loans and subsidies for their projects.	
Non-governmental organizations	<p>Play a role in providing management services for social housing and in providing social housing and capacity-building.</p> <p>Promote the ownership of the KPIs outside the local government; facilitates liaising with data producer entities; eases the collection and interpretation of data</p>	Resources: close cooperation with owners of apartments, knowledge of local situation	lack of transparency of the organisations, political agendas, lack of stable financing since NGOs depend on fundraising	Through more active cooperation with national authorities, which will be established within the project, NGOs will focus on specific professional products and services they develop which will help them to improve organisational and financial stability	To bring to the discussion on smart cities prospective of women, youth other vulnerable groups which the NGOs represent. to ensure interests of those groups are reflected in smart sustainable cities strategies.

4. PROJECT STRATEGY: OBJECTIVE, EXPECTED ACCOMPLISHMENTS, INDICATORS, MAIN ACTIVITIES

4.1. Project Strategy

The adoption of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development by the United Nations General Assembly in 2015, the adoption of the New Urban Agenda in 2016 and of other key international agreements established a comprehensive policy framework for promoting smart sustainable urban development at national and local levels based on cross-sectoral cooperation and involvement of all stakeholders. The development of the UNECE/UN-Habitat/ITU Key Performance Indicators on Smart Sustainable Cities and the UN-Habitat City Prosperity Index establishes a sound methodology for the implementation of sustainable urban policies at local level.

The expected results of the project are, firstly, enhanced capacities of national and local stakeholders to assess existing gaps and barriers for sustainable urban development at national and local levels; and, secondly, strengthened institutional capacity of national and local governments for the development of sustainable urban policies.

The project activities to achieve expected results will include

- Production of five City Evaluation reports with recommendations (city profiles);
- Delivery of 5 validation workshops;
- Delivery of five capacity building workshops, and
- Organisation of a regional workshop.

The project will start with the KPI evaluation. The KPI evaluation will entail a preparatory meeting with stakeholders involved in the process production and collection of data, evaluator and other relevant parties. Having cleared access to data, evaluation will be based on a standardised KPI procedure.

To ensure “no one is left behind”, the city performance evaluation will include in each pilot city a series of stakeholder consultations with participation of women’s groups, NGOs, young people to include these groups

perspectives in the city evaluation reports and to ensure representatives of vulnerable groups will benefit from smart cities solutions to be developed based on the smart sustainable cities evaluation.

As a result of the KPI evaluation, five City Evaluation Reports (city profiles) will be developed. The reports will focus on such issues as access to data, the process and the outcomes of data analysis. The recommendations included in the City Evaluation Reports will identify the areas where action is required most urgently and give direction to the types of investments that are needed to address the gaps and weaknesses. Production of the City Evaluation Reports will serve as a springboard to carry out local validation workshops and regional workshop.

Five local validation workshops will be organised to validate the analysis presented in City Evaluation Reports. Both national and local governments will participate in the workshops, with representatives of vulnerable groups (NGOs representing women, young people, old people; others) also invited. Outcomes of the workshop will be used to revise the City Evaluation Reports. Key areas of improvement, which will be identified as opportunity areas for supporting vulnerable groups will be included in the final recommendation for addressing, and in the projects for which the innovative financing will be searched for. For example, safer urban environment (i.e. proper lighting and security monitoring) can support women from being attacked on the streets; infrastructure that is built in mind with the access for persons with disabilities will help include this group in the life of the cities.

Validation workshops will entail presentations by invited experts and discussions on best practices in evidence-based policy-making, especially in relation to data production, collection, processing and decision-making (frameworks, tools, approaches). Technical information relating to the construction and the use of the KPI evaluation tool in policy-making will be delivered by experts.

UN-Habitat will assess training needs during the workshops based on insights from the process of evaluation and with a support of an online questionnaire. The questionnaire will be sent to all involved in the project in five cities – representatives of local and national authorities, stakeholders. Based on the analysis of the capacity gaps, policy-makers at national and local levels are expected to design the training workshops programmes.

The capacity building workshops will be organized on one or several topics, which will be selected by respective national and local governments in pilot cities based on the analysis and recommendations of the City Evaluation Reports. This will include the following topics: water infrastructure resilience; buildings / energy efficiency; sustainable urban transport; disaster risk reduction, including natural and technological disaster risk management; big data and ICT technologies; innovative financial instruments for investment projects. To ensure city to city learning, the workshops will include two days – one regional and one local. Representatives from other pilot cities and other cities in the UNECE region will attend the capacity building workshops to exchange experiences and best practices.

Five thematic policy packages based on the results of the capacity building workshops will be elaborated. The policy packages will be concrete projects, packages of projects for investments or action plans. They will be prepared by local governments to ensure ownership, with advice from UNECE and UN-Habitat, and will be further consulted with national authorities. After consultations, the policy packages will be forwarded to all relevant government organisations at national and local level and potential investors for support.

A concluding regional workshop will be convened to draw lessons from five validation, country-level workshops and support implementation of the recommendations included in the City Evaluation Reports. The event will focus on dissemination of good practices generated within the project and discussions about (i) harmonisation of approaches to production, collection and use of data for policy at country and international levels, (ii) on development of national action plans dedicated to better data for sustainable cities strategies, and (iii) public and private investment in sustainable development of cities.

4.2. Results Framework

Table 3 – Logical Framework

<u>Intervention logic</u>	<u>Indicators</u>	<u>Means of verification</u>
<p>Objective To strengthen capacity of national and local governments to develop and implement coherent policies and approaches for smart sustainable urban development in selected countries in the UNECE region.</p>		
<p>OC 1 Improved knowledge of stakeholders (including national and local policy-makers) of existing gaps and barriers and assessment methodology for sustainable urban development.</p>	<p>IA 1.1 Five national sets of data and recommendations (as part of the smart City Evaluation Reports) for sustainable urban development endorsed by the government authorities.</p>	<p>Five reports with recommendations available online and in print. Project results are reported to the Sectorial Committee: Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management; Committee on Transport; and UN-Habitat Assembly</p>
	<p>IA 1.2. An online tool for assessment of cities' smart sustainable status and enable modeling of city policy choices endorsed and applied by the UNECE member States</p>	<p>An online tool with data from five cities is available online at UNECE webpage. Project results are reported to the Sectorial Committee: Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management; Committee on Transport; and UN-Habitat Assembly</p>
<p>OP 1.1 Development of an online tool for simulating smart sustainable city policy choices and capacity building to use the online tool.</p> <p>The online simulation tool will be developed based on the methodology of the KPIs for smart sustainable cities and examples of the online simulation tools, such as, for example, the WHO tool HEAT¹⁰. Activity 2.2 will provide training for the governments on the tool. The tool will be developed to demonstrate the state of affairs in time, and will enable modelling, based on data changing. It will be capable of assisting users in making informed decisions about measures available for actions, including the reduction of air emissions, improving urban planning, etc. Users of the tool will be able to compare the baseline scenario and scenarios where proposed urban policies are implemented. Results of these analyses can be used to support the implementation of future urban policies.</p> <p>The activity OP2.2. The output will be also supported by the OP2.2. (see below) which includes organization of five capacity-development workshops in the target cities to train national and local authorities in the use of the online tool and to support implementation of the city profiles recommendations. As a result of the workshops, representatives of authorities and stakeholders will increase their knowledge in the use and analysis of the data on sustainable urban development and smart sustainable cities.</p>		
<p>OP 1.2 Development of five smart sustainable City Evaluation Reports with recommendations (city profiles). The evaluation reports will identify the areas where action is required most urgently and give direction to the types of investments that are needed to address the gaps and weaknesses. The evaluation reports are based on standard template agreed by partners of United for Smart Sustainable Cities Initiative, the 16 UN agencies. It is 10-15 pages report with analysis on indicator evaluation, results on stakeholder consultations and specific policy recommendations.</p>		

¹⁰ <http://www.euro.who.int/en/publications/abstracts/health-economic-assessment-tool-heat-for-walking-and-for-cycling.-methods-and-user-guide-on-physical-activity,-air-pollution,-injuries-and-carbon-impact-assessments-2017>

<p>OP A1.3 Organization of five local validation workshops to validate smart sustainable City Evaluation Reports (city profiles). The workshops will be organized in the five pilot cities to validate city evaluation reports' analysis and recommendations. The participants, national and local governments, will receive draft city profiles and prepare their comments, then they will participate in the moderated workshops where joint work on the validation of the city profiles will foster vertical coordination and cooperation; participation of all key ministries and national agencies working on different aspects of smart sustainable cities (environmental, social, economic aspects) will promote horizontal cooperation. The workshops will be 1.5 day so that half of a day stakeholder consultation meetings will be organized back to back with the workshop to ensure feedback from the local population; key local stakeholders, including NGOs, academia, women's groups will be invited to the consultation meetings. To ensure the national government participation in the project, including in the workshops, national steering committees will be established which will be led by senior government officials from the ministries responsible for urban development and/or smart cities.</p>		
<p>OC 2 Strengthened technical capacity of local governments for the financing and implementation of urban development projects and programmes.</p>	<p>IA 2.2 Based on the smart sustainable City Evaluation Reports (city profiles), at least one proposal for investment developed in each target city based on the smart sustainable city profiles and submitted for financing.</p>	<p>Local governments will elaborate and start implementation of specific policies, action plans to support sustainable urban development.</p>
<p>OP 2.1. Capacity gap analysis and assessment of training needs Prior to the organisation of the workshop, UN-Habitat will organise analysis of capacity building gaps and assessment of training needs using an online questionnaire, which will be developed and sent to the concerned local authorities and relevant stakeholders, based on the questionnaire results, the five capacity building workshops content will be prepared.</p>		
<p>OP 2.2 Capacity building workshops Organization of five capacity-development workshops in the target cities to train national and local authorities in the use of the online tool and to support implementation of the city profiles recommendations. The workshops will be organized on one or several topics, which will be selected by respective national and local governments in pilot cities based on the analysis and recommendations of the city profiles. This can include the following topics: water infrastructure resilience; buildings / energy efficiency; sustainable urban transport; disaster risk reduction, including natural and technological disaster risk management; big data and ICT technologies; innovative financial instruments for investment projects. To ensure city-to-city learning, representatives from other cities in the UNECE region, including the pilot cities, will attend the capacity building workshops. This activity will also support the OC1.2. as it will produce knowledge base on the use and analysis of the data on smart sustainable cities.</p>		
<p>OP 2.3 Policy packages in cities Development of five policy packages, including action plans or specific proposals for investments (both from public and private sector) based on the results of the capacity building workshops. These concrete proposals for projects to be considered for investments; they will be prepared by the respective local governments to ensure the ownership with advice from the UNECE and UN-Habitat and further will be consulted with representatives of national governments. After the consultations, they will be forwarded to national governments and potential investors for support and funding.</p>		
<p>OP 2.4 Concluding regional conference Organization of a concluding regional workshop with an investment segment with participation of national and international investors where the local authorities will present and discuss with the investors the developed policy packages. The regional workshop will also allow to share lessons learned and disseminate best practices generated within the project. A report with a list and short descriptions of the best practices will be prepared. This concerns development of laws, concepts, other relevant activities.</p>		

4.3 Risk and mitigation actions

Table 4 – Risks and mitigation actions

Risks	Likelihood of risks	Mitigating Actions
Sensitive information/data: data that exists but is not	It is likely in some countries this will be the case, depending on national	The risk will be mitigated by using aggregated data or applying additional

open. Inaccurate data: (official) data that exists but highly diverges from other (official and international) sources.	capacity of data collection on national and local level	indicators.
Political changes in local governments that may reduce the level of engagement	There is a comparatively low possibility for the decrease of the engagement because economically cities are motivated to do evaluations to promote smartness and innovation	The risk will be mitigated by a careful advance planning of activities in close cooperation with the governments as well as all key relevant stakeholders and allocating enough time for implementation. Support of local universities/think tanks will be also ensured to mitigate this possible risk.

4.4 Sustainability

Sustainability was included in the project design. The city evaluation builds on MoUs to be signed with the cities which reflect city priorities, and the project is designed to ensure its activities include political commitment and active involvement of city governments and relevant stakeholders. To sustain the project's achievements beyond the completion of the project, the KPI evaluation will be developed to ensure that recommendations are both relevant and meaningful for local governments. The phasing out strategy and ensuring national ownership are based on the development of policy packages (such as funding programme, action plan, etc) that will be developed by the local governments following on the evaluation.

The capacity of national and local governments which will be developed within the project, will also be an important factor of the long-term sustainability of the project outcomes. The project's long-term results will be ensured through regular information and reports on project outcomes from cities and UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management.

5. MONITORING AND EVALUATION

5.1. Monitoring

To monitor the implementation of the project, regular meetings with focal points will be organised. UNECE will prepare annual progress reports according to the established by DESA CDO deadlines. The project will develop a questionnaire to assess the quality of workshops.

5.2 Final Report

UNECE, in cooperation with UN-Habitat, will prepare a final report in line with template provided by DESA. The report will provide an overview of the project and its achievements and will include learning and recommendations for subsequent activities, both for countries, UN organizations, and donors to ensure sustainability of outcomes. Final report together with evaluation report will be submitted to DESA CDO by 31 March 2024.

5.3. External Evaluation

This project will not be evaluated in accordance with the Development Account Evaluation Framework.¹¹

6. MANAGEMENT, PARTNERSHIP AND COORDINATION AGREEMENTS

UNECE is the executing entity and the project will be managed by the Housing and Land Management Subprogramme in cooperation with other UNECE subprogrammes (environment, transport, economic cooperation and integration, sustainable energy, forestry and timber) through the UNECE Nexus on sustainable and smart cities for all ages.¹² UN-Habitat is collaborating as an implementing partner.

In addition, the project will build on the achievements and experiences of

- THE PEP – the Transport, Health and Environment Pan-European Programme, especially on its work on urban transport, THE PEP Toolbox and THE partnerships.

¹¹ [https://www.un.org/development/desa/da/wp-content/uploads/sites/52/da-project-management-documents/2256_1571321768_UN%20DA%20Evaluation%20Framework%20\(Final\).pdf](https://www.un.org/development/desa/da/wp-content/uploads/sites/52/da-project-management-documents/2256_1571321768_UN%20DA%20Evaluation%20Framework%20(Final).pdf)

¹² <https://www.unece.org/index.php?id=52144>

- The UNECE Joint Task Force on Energy Efficiency Standards in Buildings, which is a joint expert group on the topic of the UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit and the Sustainable Energy Division.

The responsibilities of the UNECE will include coordination of activities with the governments on the topics related to UNECE expertise, development of smart sustainable city profiles, organisation of workshops and provision of trainers for these workshops, support with the development of evidence-based policies.

The project will be implemented in partnership with UN-Habitat and through partnerships in the region, drawing on the existing regional networks.¹³ The approach is described below.

UN-Habitat will be working together with the UNECE to prepare the smart sustainable cities profiles and will also provide trainers for the capacity building workshops.

The project will be implemented through close coordination with UN Country Teams in the mentioned countries through joint planning with relevant agencies, such as UNDP, UNEP, ITU and others. Capacity building events will be organized jointly with the UN agencies with relevant expertise and presence in the countries to ensure continuity of the project results, and all possible synergies will be created with other members of the UNCTs. Teleconferences will be organized with Resident Coordinators in the respective countries at least twice per year. The project activity will be included in the UNSDCF joint work plans.

The project will be closely coordinated with the UNDA project implemented by the five Regional Commissions of the United Nations (RCs), ECLAC, ECE, ECA, ESCAP and ESCWA; and UN-Habitat. “Implementing the New Urban Agenda and the urban dimension of the 2030 Development Agenda and strengthening inter-regional cooperation towards sustainable urban development”. The Regional Commission’s project which was submitted by ECLAC is aimed at strengthening collaboration between the UN regions on sustainable urban development and will support the development of an interregional strategy towards the implementation of the NUA and the Urban Dimension of the 2030 Agenda for sustainable development. The project therefore will provide a wider, i.e., global policy framework for the ECE-UN-Habitat project work and will feed the ECE led project with new knowledge on approaches to in other global regions and good practices of the implementation of the NUA and the 2030 Agenda. In practice, this knowledge transfer will be organised through dedicated sessions on NUA and 2030 Agenda implementation at all the in person and online (through e-learning) trainings organised within the ECE-UN-Habitat project. In relation to specific capacity building activities at country level, activities of the two projects will be closely coordinated as well: the RCs’ project will include the city of Almaty, Kazakhstan.

The project will utilize the experience accumulated within the organization, such as THE PEP which is joint programme of the UNECE Environment and Sustainable Transport Divisions and the UNECE-WHO Regional Office for Europe Protocol on Water and Health. THE PEP developed guidance documents¹⁴ for city and national governments to develop sustainable urban mobility and transport infrastructure plans that promote safety, environment and health in cities. These will be included in training materials for capacity building events. The project will also build on the expert network and knowledge base of the UNECE Joint Task Force on Energy Efficiency Standards in Buildings, such as a study on mapping energy efficiency standards in buildings, and a study on mapping energy efficiency technologies in buildings.

¹³ Relevant ministries responsible for housing and energy, Heads of delegation to the UNECE Housing and Land Management Committee, the UNECE network of experts on energy efficiency in buildings, EU Energy Community Secretariat, etc.

¹⁴ <https://www.unece.org/transport-health-environment-the-pep/publications.html>

7. ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: RESULT-BASED WORK PLAN AND BUDGET DETAILS

Table A1. – Results based work plan and budget

OC	Activity #	Timeframe by activity		Budget class and Code		Amount (USD)	
		Year (Y1, Y2, Y3, Y4)	Quarter (Q1, Q2, Q3, Q4)				
OC1	OP 1.1	Y1	Q1-Q3	Contractual Services	120	\$ 15,000	
				Consultants and experts	105	\$ 20,000	
	OP 1.2	Y1 and Y2	Q1-Q4	Contractual Services	120	\$ 30,000	
				Travel of Staff	115	\$ 12,500	
				General expenses Operating	125	\$ 12,000	
				Consultants and experts	105	\$ 62,500	
	OP1.3	Y2	Q1-Q4	General Assistance Temporary	015	\$ 16,000	
				Consultants and experts	105	\$ 27,500	
				Travel of Staff	115	\$ 25,000	
				General expenses Operating	125	\$ 17,500	
	OC 2	OP2.1.	Y3	Q1_Q4	Consultants and experts	105	\$ 5,000
		OP2.2	Y3	Q2-Q4	Consultants and experts	105	\$ 57,500
Travel of Staff					115	\$ 25,000	
General expenses Operating					125	\$ 17,500	
Grants and Contributions (workshops)					145	\$ 45,000	
OP2.3		Y3	Q4	General expenses Operating	125	\$7,000	
OP2.4		Y4	Q1	General Assistance Temporary	015	\$9,000	
				Consultants and experts	105	\$ 12,500	
				General expenses Operating	125	\$6,000	
				Travel of Staff	115	\$ 2,500	
				Grants and Contributions (workshops)	145	\$ 40,000	

Table 1.2 – Planned annual budget expenditure and cumulative financial implementation rate in order to be able to better track the project’s progress, estimates of expenditures to be obligated per year 15

Year	Planned annual budget expenditure	Cumulative financial implementation rate
2020	\$ 110,000	23
2021	\$ 133,000	51
2022	\$ 152,000	83
2023	\$ 70,000	100
Total	\$ 465,000	

ANNEX 2: DETAILED JUSTIFICATION BY CODE

Budget narrative (US\$ 465,000)

General Temporary Assistance (015) US\$ 25,000

Temporary assistance in support of activities A1.3 and A2.4 (5 work months x \$5,000 per work month).

Consultants (105) US\$ 185,000

(a) *International consultants' fees = US\$105,000*

International consultants to:

Develop the online tool in support of activity OP.1.1 (2-month x \$10,000 per month); Develop five City Evaluation Reports in support of activity OP.1.2 (5 x \$10,000 per city); = \$70,000.

International consultants at UN-Habitat in support of activity OP2.1. training needs assessment \$5,000 and OP.2.2 to provide substantive inputs five training workshops (5 workshops x \$6,000 per month) = \$35,000.

(b) *National / Regional consultants = US\$ 30,000*

- Five national/regional consultants to support organization of validation and training workshops, in support of activity OP1.3, OP2.2 (5 consultants at \$3,000 per month at 2 times) = \$30,000

(c) *Consultants' travel = US\$ 50,000*

20 missions of consultants to prepare City Evaluation Reports OP1.2 (5 missions), travelling to validation workshops OP 1.3. (5 missions), capacity building workshops in support of activity OP2.2 (5 missions); five regional consultants to final regional workshop OP2.4. (\$2,500 average mission cost) x (20 missions)

Contractual services (120) US\$ 45,000

A provision of \$45,000 is required for the collection of data for the online tool and collection of data from cities and government organizations, according to KPIs in support of activity OP1.1. and OP1.2.

Travel of Staff US\$ 65,000

UN Staff from the implementing entity

18 missions by one UNECE staff: to prepare City Evaluation Reports in support of activity OP1.2 (5 missions), travelling to validation workshops and capacity building workshops in support of activities OP1.3 and OP2.2 (10 missions). (\$2,500 average mission cost) x (15 missions) = \$37,500

Staff from other UN entities collaborating in project

19 missions by one UN-Habitat staff to support OP1.2 (5 missions) validation workshops OP1.3 (5 missions) and to capacity building workshops in support of activity OP2.2 (5 missions). Travel for UN-Habitat staff to the final conference in Geneva (1 mission). (\$2,500 average mission cost) x (11 missions) = \$27,500

General operating expenses US\$ 60,000

A provision of 35,000 is required for the venue rental, simultaneous interpretation and other operational costs related to the organization of the five validation and five training workshops in support of activities OP1.3. and OP.2.2. Duration of each workshop: 2 days; \$3,500 per workshop x 10 workshops = \$35,000.

A provision of \$6,000 is required for miscellaneous costs related to the organization of the regional workshop in support of activity OP.2.4. Duration of the workshop: 2 days. Conference room rent, and interpretation are in-kind from the UNECE.

Printing five City Evaluation Reports in English and Russian in support of activities OP1.2, 2.3 = \$19,000.

Grants and contributions (145) US\$ 85,000

(a) Five capacity building workshops in support of activity OP.2.2. Duration of the workshop: 2 days. Travel of participants from other cities in the region, including tickets and DSA: \$1,500 per participant x 6 participants x 5 workshops = \$45,000.

(b) One regional concluding workshop in Geneva, Switzerland for the UNECE region in support of activity OP.2.4. Duration of the workshop: 2 days. Travel of 20 participants, including tickets and DSA: \$2,000 per participant x 20 participants x 1 workshop = \$40,000.